Pastoralism and livestock marketing at the margins

Reflections on diverging prospects and pathways for pastoralism in the Horn of Africa

ODI, London, September 24th, 2014
Diverging pastoralisms in the Horn

• Deepening vulnerability alongside burgeoning livestock trades

• Destitution is widespread in many pastoral areas - poverty seems to worsen alongside economic growth and intensifying integration

• Vulnerability is a moving target

• To what extent does livestock commercialisation in the region help reduce poverty? What else is needed to address present high levels of vulnerability and destitution? Over the longer-term, how can sustainable transitions out of livestock-keeping be supported?
Genesis of our work

• Pastoral innovations happening under the radar alongside wider dynamic changes in the region, particularly in livestock marketing and trade
• New perspective of pastoralism needed, one starting from the margins
• Multiple pathways of change
Future of Pastoralism conference

- March 2011, over 100 participants, Ministers from 3 governments in the region
- Horn of Africa food security crisis was unfolding
- Moving beyond doom and gloom narrative of pastoralism
- Fortune and loss existing side by side
Trends: domestic livestock trade

• Pastoralist areas - main suppliers of livestock for the population living within and adjacent to ~60% of Ethiopia

• Suppliers of:
  • 20% of the plough oxen
  • stall-fed cattle to high end butcheries
  • breeding stock for farmers, donor/government projects
  • and camels to mid-altitude farmers

• This contribution from pastoralist areas is often unnoticed at policy level
## Trends in live animals and meat export, Ethiopia 2005-2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Live animals</th>
<th>Value ($1,000)</th>
<th>Meat (tons)</th>
<th>Value ($1000)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2005/06</td>
<td>163,000</td>
<td>27,259</td>
<td>7,717</td>
<td>15,598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006/07</td>
<td>234,000</td>
<td>36,507</td>
<td>7,917</td>
<td>18,448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007/08</td>
<td>298,000</td>
<td>40,865</td>
<td>5,875</td>
<td>15,471</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008/09</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>77,330</td>
<td>6,400</td>
<td>24,480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009/10</td>
<td>334,000</td>
<td>91,000</td>
<td>10,000</td>
<td>34,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010/11</td>
<td>472,041</td>
<td>148,000</td>
<td>16,877</td>
<td>63,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011/12</td>
<td>800,000</td>
<td>207,100</td>
<td>17,800</td>
<td>78,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012/13</td>
<td>680,000</td>
<td>150,000</td>
<td>16,500</td>
<td>68,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: National Bank of Ethiopia

*Amount of Ethiopian meat exported increased up to 2.3 times from 2005 to 2013*

*cf. US beef exports increased 2.4 times in same period [www.usmef.org](http://www.usmef.org)*
Export trends: foundation and drivers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Livestock-specific</th>
<th>National rinderpest eradication (to May 2005)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Generic</td>
<td>Reversion to more liberalized trade environment (from 1992)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• industry associations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• domestic price deregulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• more liberalized foreign trade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• streamlining bureaucracy for exporters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• more liberal investment and labour laws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Improved roads and mobile phone network</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DEMANDS PRICES**

Private sector facilities – abattoirs, holding grounds etc
Private feedlots, increased market stratification

**Livestock-specific**

Robust pastoralist livestock production system, responsive to market opportunities (from 1920s)
Proxy data for Ethiopia’s informal exports

Recorded Exports of Livestock, Berbera (“from or through the Somaliland Protectorate”) 1927-1951

- Between 1927 and 1950 Berbera exported ~ 3x more animals/year than Ethiopia exports today
- Between 2011 and 2013 Berbera exported ~ 5x more animals than Ethiopia
- Other transit routes via Djibouti, Puntland, Somalia and Sudan
- Kenya is a terminal route

Hunt (1951)
Somaliland Chamber of Commerce (2014)
Opportunities to ‘move up’ unevenly shared

... As seen in the views of Maasai from Laikipia

‘A lot of what we have been talking about seems to involve biashara – new forms of business, expanding existing enterprises, adding value to our herds. There have been good results for many of us.’

‘Everything is in a mess now, nothing is improving. Land is going, going, gone. Livestock are being lost in large numbers. Although we were able to respond in new ways to the 2009 drought, and we survived, will we again?’
• Still, growth in livestock exports and marketing regarded as promising pathway for development in pastoral areas

• Yet, with so many clearly not benefiting from this, more critical reflection is needed on what inclusive growth and transformation might look like in pastoral areas?
Visions of agricultural development

• A key assumption underlying the New Alliance is that agricultural sector growth will reduce poverty

• What is the evidence that larger private investments in agriculture (typically favouring large-scale production) will have wider beneficial outcomes in terms of food security, nutrition and women’s economic standing?

• What public support and policies are most likely to promote the position of small producers, whose own investment and contribution to local economies often dwarves that of large private sector investors?
New Alliance and Pastoralism

• Marketing and trade:
  • General investment policy is skewed towards crop production rather than livestock;
  • The pastoral production system is performing well - but no substantial investments in commercial livestock farms in non-pastoral areas

• Investments:
  • Existing inequalities mean benefits unlikely to be equitably shared
  • Pastoralist land and resource rights often illegible to outsiders

• Social protection:
  • Still limited reach in pastoral areas although significant experimentation
  • Largely funded by development donors... but emphasis on scaling-up and increasing treasury allocations for social assistance
Making policy space for pastoralism

• The openings for policy reform often develop in an unplanned way, often when a number of favourable conditions unexpectedly coincide. Constant monitoring of the policy environment, and the skills to recognise and capitalise on these opportunities when they arise, are essential for those wishing to influence policy either within government or outside it.

• Policy change may involve framing an issue differently and offering an alternative narrative, as much as weighing up objective evidence and options. Evidence is, however, critical in generating legitimacy for the new narrative.
Thank you